

1 NEAL S. MANNE (94101)
 RICHARD W. HESS (*pro hac vice*)
 2 SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.
 1000 Louisiana, Suite 5100
 3 Houston, Texas 77002
 Telephone: (713) 651-9366
 4 Facsimile: (713) 654-6666
 nmanne@susmangodfrey.com
 5 rhess@susmangodfrey.com

6 MARC SELTZER (54534)
 STEPHEN E. MORRISSEY (187865)
 7 KATHRYN P. HOEK (219247)
 SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.
 8 1901 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 950
 Los Angeles, CA 90067
 9 Telephone: (310) 789-3100
 Facsimile: (310) 789-3150
 10 mseltzer@susmangodfrey.com
 smorrissey@susmangodfrey.com

11 *Attorneys for Defendant Walmart.com USA LLC*

12
 13 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 14 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

15 OSCAR MACIAS, on behalf of himself and others)
 similarly situated,)

16 Plaintiff,)

17 v.)

18 NETFLIX, INC., and WALMART.COM USA LLC,)

19 Defendants.)
 20)
 21)
 22)
 23)
 24)
 25)
 26)
 27)
 28)

Civil Action No. CV-09-00961-JCS

**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO
 CONSIDER WHETHER CASES
 SHOULD BE RELATED**

1 **TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR COUNSEL OF RECORD:**

2 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Defendant Walmart.com USA LLC (“Walmart.com”)
3 submits this Administrative Motion to relate *Macias v. Netflix, Inc.*, Case No. CV-09-00961-JCS
4 (“*Macias*”), filed on February 2, 2009 in the Superior Court of the State of California in and for
5 the County of Santa Clara, and removed on March 5, 2009 to the United States District Court for
6 the Northern District of California, to the cases listed in Section I pursuant to Local Civil Rule 3-
7 12.

8 **I. RELATED CASES**

9 Please see Exhibit 1 (“Related Cases”) to the Declaration of Kathryn P. Hoek in Support of
10 Walmart.com’s Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Cases Should be Related (“Hoek
11 Decl.”).

12 **II. RELATIONSHIP OF THE ACTIONS**

13 The *Macias* case involves substantially the same parties, transactions, and events as those
14 at issue in the earliest-filed case, *Resnick v. Walmart.com USA LLC*, CV-09-0002-PJH (“*Resnick*”)
15 and the Related Cases: specifically, an alleged agreement between Netflix, Inc. and Walmart.com
16 “to divide the markets for the sales and online rentals of DVDs in the United States . . . , with the
17 specific purpose and intended effect of monopolizing and otherwise unreasonably restraining trade
18 in the online DVD rental market.” Hoek Decl., Ex. 2 (*Macias* Compl.) ¶ 1. Plaintiff Macias seeks
19 to assert claims for alleged antitrust violations under California’s Cartwright Act, Cal. Bus. &
20 Prof. Code §§ 16720, 16727. The Plaintiffs in the Related Cases seek to assert claims for alleged
21 antitrust violations under the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1 and 2.

22 Plaintiff Macias seeks to represent a putative class that is entirely encompassed by the
23 putative classes in *Resnick* and the Related Cases. Plaintiff Macias seeks to represent a putative
24 class of “[a]ll residents of California who paid a ‘subscription fee’ to Netflix to rent DVDs online
25 after May 19, 2005 up to the present.” Hoek Decl., Ex. 2 ¶ 19. Plaintiffs in the *Resnick* action
26 seek to represent a putative class made up of “[a]ny person the United States that paid a
27 subscription fee to Netflix to rent DVDs, on or after May 19, 2005 up to the present.” Hoek Decl.,
28 Ex. 3 (*Resnick* Compl.) ¶ 55.

1 Relating these cases will help eliminate duplicative discovery, prevent inconsistent pretrial
2 rulings, and conserve the resources of the parties, counsel, and this Court.

3 **III. CONCLUSION**

4 *Macias* and the Related Cases satisfy the criteria of Local Civil Rule 3-12. Therefore,
5 Walmart.com respectfully requests that *Macias* be deemed related to the cases listed in Section I
6 and be assigned to the Honorable Phyllis J. Hamilton.

7
8
9 Dated: March 12, 2009

Respectfully submitted,

10 SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.

11
12 By: /s/ Kathryn P. Hoek

13 Neal S. Manne
14 Richard W. Hess
15 1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100
Houston, Texas 77002
Telephone: (713) 651-9366
Facsimile: (713) 654-6666

16 Marc M. Seltzer
17 Stephen E. Morrissey
18 Kathryn P. Hoek
19 1901 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 950
Los Angeles, CA 90067
20 Telephone: (310) 789-3100
Facsimile: (310) 789-3150

21 *Attorneys for Defendant Walmart.com USA*
22 *LLC*